



LA SALLE COUNTY APPRAISAL DISTRICT  
204 NORTHEAST LANE  
COTULLA, TEXAS 78014  
PHONE: (830) 879-4756 FAX: (830) 879-4067

**MINUTES  
BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

**April 30, 2019**

**A. MEETING CALLED TO ORDER**

The La Salle County Appraisal District Board of Directors convened for a regular called meeting on District business on Tuesday, April 30, 2019, at the La Salle County Appraisal District's Board Room located at 204 Northeast Lane, Cotulla, Texas.

**Board Chairman Michael Whitwell called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.** Board Chairman called roll. Members present were Elizabeth Martinez, Deonicio Ramirez Jr., Carle Storey, Alfredo Zamora, Jr., and Michael Whitwell. Absent was Board Member Dora A. Gonzales. **A quorum was established.**

**Motion to excuse Dora A. Gonzales, Board Secretary.** Motion to excuse by Ms. Elizabeth Martinez, Vice-Chairwoman; Second by Mr. Deonicio Ramirez, Jr., Board Member. **Motion carried with unanimous consent.**

**Pledge of Allegiance was led by Michael Whitwell, Chairman.**

Martin Villarreal, Chief Appraiser proceeded to recognize Appraisal District staff present, they were, Joshua Zamarripa, Appraisal/Real Property Operations Coordinator, Robert Peregoy, Deputy Chief Appraiser, Norma Maldonado, Business/Finance Manager, Ravinder Rawat, GIS Director, and Ismael Ramirez, Jr., Analysis/Commercial Real Property Supervisor. Also present were Larry Dovalina, City Manager for the City of Cotulla and Dr. Jack Seals, Superintendent for Cotulla ISD.

**B. PRESENTATIONS, ANNOUNCEMENTS, RECOGNITIONS AND REPORTS**

**ITEM #1 Communications.** Mr. Martin Villarreal, Chief Appraiser, began his presentation by advising the Board that the financials through March 31, 2019 were being provided on an informational basis only, with no formal action being required as this item would be brought back at the next Board meeting for formal approval.

Mr. Villarreal then proceeded to the Chief Appraiser's Report and notified the Board that Mr. Peregoy would be providing the Board with an update regarding the District's 2019 Appraisal Activities and handed over the floor to Mr. Peregoy. Mr. Peregoy began his report by providing the Board with a summary of the various issues and deficiencies that were identified and worked on over the preceding months. The issues identified were flat value on land, property categorization issues, incorrect homestead cap calculations, the establishment of market areas in La Salle County, property improvement classification issues with regard to all hotel properties, GEO ID issues, and double assessments. After providing this summary, Mr. Peregoy then covered each of the items in greater detail in an effort to inform the Board of the

specifics of each issue, and the work that went into correcting the various deficiencies. Regarding the land flat value issues, Mr. Peregoy informed the Board that the District moved forward with analyzing various market transactions, and moved forward with the creation of land matrices which now allow the district to appraise all land in the County in an equal and uniform manner. Mr. Peregoy continued by notifying the Board that the previous information in the database related to state property classification guidelines was incorrectly applied, and in need of correction. As such, Mr. Peregoy notified the Board that all accounts were reviewed for state classification purposes, and provided the Board with a summary of the new property counts based on the corrections that have been made. Mr. Peregoy then proceeded to provide a follow up to the Board regarding the incorrect homestead cap calculation project which has been a work in progress over the preceding weeks. He stated that a small number of accounts were still pending to be reviewed, but once complete, all errors would be corrected going forward. Mr. Peregoy continued by advising the Board that the District has now established market areas based on neighborhoods across all property types in La Salle County to allow the District to apply mass appraisal adjustments and organize mass appraisal activities. A breakdown of the market areas by property type was provided to the Board so that they were aware of the work that was completed. Mr. Peregoy reminded the Board that this initiative was identified in the District's amended re-appraisal plan which was presented to the Board back in November. Mr. Peregoy proceeded to advise the Board that one of the larger issues identified was the fact that all hotel properties were previously classified as office buildings. Mr. Villarreal interjected and stated that due to ongoing litigation with a local hotel property, the District would not be able to defend its position from an equal and uniform standpoint due to these properties being misclassified. In addition, Mr. Villarreal also notified the Board that although an income approach to value was applied to hotel properties, the manner in which the income approach was carried out was not defensible, and utilized a gross income multiplier method, with no other evidence or data to support the calculations which were made. As such, Mr. Villarreal provided the Board with information evidencing the manner in which the income approach calculations were carried out for all hotels in La Salle County in 2019. After a brief discussion regarding the current hotel appraisals, and the previous hotel appraisals performed by the District's previous appraisal services provider, Mr. Peregoy continued to the next item in his report. Mr. Peregoy touched briefly on the efforts to correct all GEO ID's in the La Salle CAD database. The Board was advised that approximately six thousand (6,000) accounts have been corrected with the new GEO ID sequence that has been developed, and was also notified that work would continue to ensure all applicable GEO ID's are corrected and standardized. Mr. Peregoy proceeded to inform the Board that based on the work and research which had been done so far, a number of real property double assessments had been identified, and the necessary steps would be taken to ensure that all double assessments are corrected. In completing this portion of his report, Mr. Peregoy continued by notifying the Board of various unforeseen issues which have arisen since work began in November. These issues included the identification of additional rollback properties, additional double assessments due to surface accounts being created based on mineral deeds, and tax ceiling issues as a result of the taxing entities utilizing non-matching accounts with the Appraisal District. Based on this information, the Board was notified that work would begin to address these unforeseen issues as well. To conclude, Mr. Peregoy notified the Board that due to the state property classification issue, it was not possible to provide value statistics by property category, however, Mr. Peregoy notified the Board that in comparing the 2018 Certified Totals with the 2019 Preliminary Totals, the District was going to experience a fifteen percent (15%) increase in market value as a result of the comprehensive land reappraisal which was performed in 2019. Lastly, Mr. Peregoy provided the Board with information regarding the 2019 Notice of Appraised Value mailout schedule, as well as the proposed ARB hearing schedule for the upcoming weeks. After a brief discussion regarding the items presented by Mr. Peregoy, the Board continued with the remainder of the agenda. Prior to continuing to the next item, Dr. Seals addressed the Board, and notified them that as Superintendent he was pleased with the work that had been completed up to that point.

Mr. Villarreal continued to the next item by providing the Board with a brief update regarding the various advertisements that have been published in the local newspaper which relate to various deadlines and information pertaining to the District.

**ITEM # 2 Public Comments.** Mr. Michael Whitwell, Chairman, called for public comments, to which Mr. Larry Dovalina spoke, and publicly thanked the Appraisal District for its assistance during Lyndon B Johnson Statue Unveiling which took place at the Appraisal District office. Mr. Dovalina stated that the event would not have been as successful as it was without the additional effort and assistance provided by Mr. Villarreal and his staff.

### **C. DISCUSSION/ACTION ITEMS**

1. **Approval of the minutes for March 26, 2019:** Motion to approve by Mr. Alfredo Zamora, Jr., Board Member; second by Ms. Elizabeth Martinez, Vice-Chairwoman. **Motion carried with unanimous consent.**
2. **Approval of the District's Year 2019 Financial Reports through February 28, 2019.** Motion to approve by Ms. Elizabeth Martinez, Vice-Chairwoman; second by Mr. Alfredo Zamora, Jr., Board Member. **Motion carried with unanimous consent.**
3. **Discussion and possible action to select a financial auditing firm for professional services to conduct an examination of the District's 2018 financials:** Motion to select and approve the firm of Canales, Garza, and Baum PLLC at a rate of \$12,000 per year for three years by Mr. Alfredo Zamora, Jr., Board Member; second by Mr. Deonicio Ramirez, Jr., Board Member. **Motion carried with unanimous consent.**
4. **Discussion and possible action to approve mileage reimbursement policy and rate to Appraisal Review Board members:** Motion to approve by Mr. Deonicio Ramirez, Jr., Board Member; second by Mr. Alfredo Zamora, Jr., Board Member. **Motion carried with unanimous consent.**

### **E. OTHER BUSINESS AND ADJOURNMENT**

**ITEM #1 Next Board Meeting Date:** It was established that the Board would be contacted at a later date to schedule their next meeting sometime in early June.

**ITEM #2 Adjournment:** Motion to adjourn by Ms. Elizabeth Martinez, Vice-Chairwoman; second by Mr. Deonicio Ramirez, Jr., Board Member. **Motion carried with unanimous consent.**

**ADJOURN TIME: 4:10 P.M.**

**APPROVED THIS 10<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF JUNE, 2019**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**MICHAEL WHITWELL**  
CHAIRMAN, BOARD OF DIRECTORS

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**DORA A. GONZALES**  
SECRETARY, BOARD OF DIRECTORS